

Provider-Based Evaluation (ProBE) 2016

Introduction to 2016 Criteria

OVERVIEW OF ProBE 2016 CRITERIA

TOTAL CRITERIA	STAGES	MANDATORY CRITERIA	NON-MANDATORY CRITERIA
47 criteria	1: Emerging	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Refers to Government Online Service (GOS) criteria which are fundamental to drive user satisfaction and usage. Absence of such criteria has severe impact on fulfilment of user needs. 	30% for Emerging & Enhanced stages
	2: Enhanced		
	3: Transactional	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Criteria are not assigned with score but their provision in the website are compulsory. 	70% for Transactional and Connected stages
	4: Connected	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Agencies that do not fulfill mandatory criteria will be moved down to 3-star and below. 	
	5: Innovative		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Refers to use of GOS to generate opportunities via greater people participation. Criteria will be developed for ProBE 2017 onwards.

ProBE 2016 MANDATORY CRITERIA FEATURES

(3 ENHANCED, 2 NEW)

Criteria	2015 Target	2016 Target
Downtime	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Agencies with SLA: Downtime is within the stipulated SLA Agencies without SLA: Downtime is within 0.5% (43 hours and 48 mins) 	Continue
Loading Time	10 seconds and below	5 seconds and below
Responsiveness to Enquiries	Proper response to users' enquiries within the time limit set by the respective Agencies' Client Charter	Proper response is as per Client's Charter but should not exceed 7 working days*
Updated Content	Updated information in 6 Sections: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) News, Activities, Updated events 2) Announcement, Information & Broadcast 3) Newspaper clippings, press statements or articles 4) Poster/Banner 5) Tender/Quotation/Recruitment announcements 6) Ministers, Deputy Ministers & Senior Management of Agencies 	Updated information in 7 Sections. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inclusion of an additional item i.e. 'News and/or updates on government policies'
Mobile Web	Not applicable	Website must utilise responsive web design**
Active Hyperlink	Not applicable	All hyperlinks within the website must be active

New!

New!

Selection of criteria are based on user expectations and global standards

Note

*As per Panduan Pengurusan Perhubungan Pelanggan of Pekeliling Kemajuan Pentadbiran Awam Bilangan 1 Tahun 2008

**Layout changes based on the size and capabilities of the device

CRITERIA ACCORDING TO 7 PILLARS OF USER EXPECTATION

Criteria	PILLAR 1: SITE PERFORMANCE	PILLAR 2: FUNCTIONALITY	PILLAR 3: CONTENT	PILLAR 4: NAVIGATION	PILLAR 5: SEARCH	PILLAR 6: ONLINE TRANSPARENCY	PILLAR 7: LOOK AND FEEL
Mandatory	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Loading Time (5 Seconds) 2. Downtime 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3. Mobile Web / Version 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 4. Updated Content 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Active Hyperlink 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 6. Responsiveness to Enquiries 	
Non-Mandatory		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 7. Mobile apps 8. Number of Online Services 9. Notification of Transaction 10. Aid, Tools & Help Resources 11. Online Service Security 12. Broadcast 13. Electronic Archive 14. W3C Disability Accessibility 15. Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ) 16. Feedback Form 17. Feedback Auto-Notification 18. User Opinion Features 19. Updates via Email or RSS 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 20. Audio/ Video 21. Multi-Language for Content 22. Multi-language for Online Services 23. Publicising an agency CIO or equivalent 24. Contact Details 25. Presence of Datasets 26. Dataset Guidelines 27. About Us 28. Publications 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 29. Personalisation 30. Sitemap 31. Links to Other Websites 32. Find Information within 3 Clicks 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 33. Search Function 34. Advanced Search 35. Searchable Database 36. Find Website Using Search Tool 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 37. Client Charter 38. Achievement of Client Charter 39. Statistic of Online Services 40. Freedom of Information Legislation 41. Privacy Policy Statement/Data Protection Act 42. Online Procurement Announcement 43. Online E-Participation Policy/Guideline 44. Promotion of E-participation Initiative 45. Presence of E-Consultation Mechanisms 46. Presence of E-Decision Making Tools 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 47. Look and Feel

SCORING MECHANISM

		WEBSITE	ALL WEBSITES			
		Stages	Mandatory Criteria		Non-Mandatory Criteria	
			Weightage	Description	Weightage	Description
SUPPLY	Emerging	Yes or No		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No scoring assigned Fail or Pass Not meeting the criteria will result in websites receiving a maximum of 3-Star 	30%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not meeting the criteria will result loss of mark Based on assignment of weightage
	Enhanced					
DEMAND	Transactional				70%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 30% for Emerging & Enhanced stages 70% for Transactional and Connected stages
	Connected					
	Innovative					



MANDATORY CRITERIA

(1) Loading Time (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Loading Time refers to the amount of time (in seconds) it takes for a page to load, from initiation of the pageview (e.g., click on a page link) to load completion in the browser.¹• ProBE Loading Time indicator: 5 seconds and below
Tips	<p>Utilise “Google PageSpeed Insights”².</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Google PageSpeed test measures and analyses the page and generates report on specific recommendations to improve the speed of the page.³• Recommendations are based on general principles of web page performance, including resource caching, data upload and download size, and client-server round-trip times.⁴

¹ [Google Analytics: Interpret Site Speed](#)

² [Google Developers: PageSpeed Insight](#)

³ [Google Developers: About PageSpeed Insight](#)

⁴ [Practical Ecommerce: 10 Free Online Speed Test](#)

(1) Loading Time (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <p>a) Assessment must be undertaken during peak hours specified below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• 10.00am to 1.00pm, or• 2.00pm to 4.00pm <p>b) Assessment to be undertaken by using an online tool "Seomastering.com": http://www.seomastering.com/site-speed-checker.php</p> <p>c) Only online tool identified above will be accepted. Utilisation of other Online Tool will not be accepted</p>
Information Gathering Process	<p>ProBE Self-Assessment System</p> <p>1) Submit the result from the online tool "Seomastering.com"</p>

(2) Downtime (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Downtime refers to the occasions whereby the website is not operational and is not accessible by the users¹• Downtime does not include scheduled maintenance period in which the agency has informed users of the time and duration of website unavailability for access• Only the main page of the website is observed for downtime criterion. Downtime for Online Services will not be measured in this criterion
Tips	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Utilise and subscribe to a reliable Online Tool• There are many Online Tools available to assist to track your website. Most of these tools send immediate alerts to website admin when the website crashes

¹ [Whatis: Uptime and Downtime](#), [Cloudendure: Cloud Downtime](#)

(2) Downtime (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <p>a) Website downtime must be within the stipulated SLA of respective agencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For agencies without SLA: Must comply to 99.5% uptime (43 hours, 48 minutes downtime) <p>b) Notification of the website inaccessibility must be displayed on other official channels such as myGov or agency social media accounts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agency that does not own any official social media accounts are required to utilise its parent website or official accounts <p>c) Scheduled maintenance is not considered as incidence of Downtime</p>
Information Gathering Process	<p>ProBE Self-Assessment System</p> <p>1) Submit the stipulated SLA for website uptime/downtime for 2016 (SLA to be uploaded in the system)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The default uptime for agencies without SLA will be 99.5% • Each downtime incidence must be keyed into the system

(3) Updated Content (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>Updated Content refers to the update and review of information on the website. There are seven (7) elements of Updating Content:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Latest news, activities or updated events ii. Announcement, information and broadcast iii. Newspaper clippings, press statements or articles iv. Poster/Banner v. Tender / Quotation / Recruitment announcements vi. Minister, Deputy Minister and Senior Management of the agencies vii. News and /or updates on government policies
Tips	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Content and business owners of the information displayed on the website are encouraged to check their information regularly to verify and ensure the information are accurate and up-to-date¹ • Consistent engagement with users via feedback forms, surveys and focus groups allow website managers to understand user's perspective and input on the content of website¹

¹ [Keep It Fresh: Steps for Updating Your Website Content](#)

(3) Updated Content (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Website must observe the updates in all of the seven relevant sections identified above b) Website must comply to the Guidelines “PERKARA-PERKARA YANG DIPANTAU BERKAITAN PENGEMASKINIAN MAKLUMAT DI LAMAN WEB” issued by MAMPU c) News and /or updates on government policies must be updated within 1 working day after the policy has been updated d) All of the seven relevant sections must be updated. Outdated sections will be considered as non compliant
Information Gathering Process	<p>ProBE Self-Assessment System:</p> <p>Upload the up-to-date screenshot of the relevant pages of their websites displaying any of the six relevant sections identified</p>

(4) Responsiveness to Enquiries (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	Responsiveness within Client's Charter refers to time frame of the response provided by the agency for the enquiries made by users via the website
Tips¹	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Agencies must clearly display the response time for responding to enquires from users in the Client's Charter section of the websites which will allow users to anticipate when a response will be received.• Content owner are encouraged to prepare further information and clarification on anticipated questions that may be asked by the users such as related regulations, roadmap and links / access to more information about the subject matter.• The basic information which are prepared in advanced are to be provided promptly to users while the respective officers are working on a more detailed and customized response (if necessary) to increase level of engagement with the users.

¹ [White Paper: The Truth Behind Web Inquiry Management Global Investment Promotion Best Practices 2012](#)

(4) Responsiveness to Enquiries (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <p>a) Default response to any enquiries by users is within 7 working days as per “PANDUAN PENGURUSAN PERHUBUNGAN PELANGGAN” of “PEKELILING KEMAJUAN PENTADBIRAN AWAM BILANGAN 1 TAHUN 2008</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• In the event where an agency has indicated Response Time under 7 working days in the Client Charter (for example: Response Time to enquiries is within 3 working days), the shorter time frame for Response Time will take effect <p>b) Response that is sent beyond the set time frame is considered as non compliant</p>
Information Gathering Process	<p>ProBE Self-Assessment System:</p> <p>1) Agency to submit the stipulated SLA for Responsiveness within Client's Charter</p>

(5) Mobile Web/Version (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	Mobile Web/Version refers to a version of the website that is customised to be viewed using mobile devices such as smart phone, tab or iPad
Tips	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li data-bbox="405 491 1858 801">• Usage of responsive technology framework allows the agency to create a similar experience for the users no matter how they are accessing the website whether on desktop, tablet or smartphone. Therefore, providing better user experience across devices. Furthermore, it is an effective way to manage the website by eliminating the need to maintain separate mobile URL and content¹<li data-bbox="405 836 1858 986">• If your agency maintains a separate Mobile Web / Version, ensure that both the desktop and mobile versions incorporate the same branding elements to ensure consistency²<li data-bbox="405 1022 1858 1219">• Never stop testing! Ensure that the Mobile Web / Version are tested consistently on different type of mobile devices and operating systems. Tests should be undertaken on every page, user action and buttons on the website³

¹ www.cio.com

² www.socialmediaexaminer.com

³ www.hootsuite.com

(5) Mobile Web/Version (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The Mobile Web version is tailored to the size of the mobile device i.e. using responsive designb) Notification of the availability of the service such as QR code or Mobile Icon must be displayed on the desktop version to inform usersc) A Mobile Web that is displayed exactly like the desktop version (without responsive design) is considered as non compliant
Information Gathering Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none">a) For agency maintaining a separate URL for Mobile Web / Version, to enter the Mobile Web / Version URL address on the Self-Assessment System

(6) Active Hyperlink (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>No Broken Link refers to active and error-free hyperlink file or document that allows user visit another location or file. Typically hyperlink is activated by clicking on a highlighted word or image on the website¹.</p> <p>Broken Link refers to a hyperlink that no longer points to its original destination. This could be for a variety of reasons: the page has been moved, the page has been renamed.²</p>
Tips	<p>5 Quick and Easy Tricks by SiteProNews.com</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Be sure that your URL is fully qualified and has 'http://' at the start of itb) Don't try to italicize or bold your website addressc) Put your URL on a new lined) Don't put punctuation after your URLe) Preview your article and test your links

¹ [Tech Terms](#)

² [About Tech: Broken Link](#)

(6) Active Hyperlink (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) All hyperlinks within the website must be activeb) Check to ensure that hyperlinks are active using Online Tool W3C Link Checker: http://validator.w3.org/checklink<ul style="list-style-type: none">i. Intranet is not considered as part of Broken Linkii. Files such as .jpg, .jpeg, .gif, .png, .css, .js, .ico, lang=bn, jsessionid are not taken into consideration for the Broken Link testiii. Broken link that originates from other domain is not considered for this criterion
Information Gathering Process	<p>ProBE Self-Assessment System:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">1) Agency to submit the result of Online Tool W3C Link Checker: http://validator.w3.org/checklink



NON - MANDATORY CRITERIA

(1) Mobile apps

Categories	Description
Definition	A mobile application refers as a type of application software designed to run on a mobile device, such as a smartphone or tablet computer. ¹
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) A quick link or an icon for the list of mobile applications provided by the agency must be clearly displayed in the websiteb) Mobile application that belongs to other agencies is not considered for assessment of this criterion

¹ <http://www.techopedia.com/definition/2953/mobile-application-mobile-app>

(2) Number of Online Services (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Number of Online Services refers to services that can be fully transacted online. These includes:<ol style="list-style-type: none">i. Government to Citizens (G2C)ii. Government to Business (G2B)iii. Government to Government (G2G) services• E-Payment is considered as an Online Service• Intranet, Complaint and Feedback Forms are not considered as Online Services

(2) Number of Online Services (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) A minimum of 1 Online Services and maximum of 5 Online Services are to be assessedb) The Online Services provide end-to-end services without off-line transaction requirementc) The Online Services must be provided within the website domain<ul style="list-style-type: none">• For Online Services that are published outside the agency website's domain, the ownership information of the Online Services is to be verifiedd) The Online Services must be displayed on the main page and hyperlinked to the location of the Online Services within the website (or the verified link if it is outside of the website's domain)e) Intranet services, complaint and feedback form are not considered for this criterion

(3) Notification of Transaction

Categories	Description
Definition	Notification of Transaction refers to the notification sent to each user after an online transaction is completed
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) All of the Online Service (identified on the Number of Online Services criterion) must provide notification at the end of every transactionb) A transaction that does not prompt any message or notification is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(4) Aid, Tools & Help Resources

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>Aid, Tools & Help Resources refers to information that will aid users when using Online Services</p> <p>Examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">i. Tipsii. Guidelinesiii. Manualiv. Flowchartv. Video Tutorial
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) All of the Online Services (identified on the Number of Online Services criterion) must have either one of the five examplesb) It must be made available on the main page of the respective online servicesc) Frequently Asked Question is not considered as part of this criterion

(5) Online Service Security

Categories	Description
Definition	Online Service Security refers to the security, authentication and protection of data sent via Internet Protocol while using Online Services ¹
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <p>a) At least one form of security measures must be provided in any of the Online Services (identified on the Number of Online Services criterion)</p> <p>b) Availability of the Public Key Infrastructure (PKI)</p> <p>Examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• SSL• Digital Certificate• Captcha <p>c) Any security measures provided must be prominently displayed on Online Services pages</p> <p>d) Online security that is provided by parent agency in a centralised online service is not considered for this criterion</p>

¹[Technopedia: Internet Security](#)

(6) Broadcast

Categories	Description
Definition	Broadcast refers to a section where announcements, news or latest updates in the agency are being made.
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Announcement must be made available on the the Broadcast section. The section should not be left blank.b) In the case where no update / announcement available, the section must display notification such as “No latest announcement is available”c) An empty broadcast section without any notification as indicated in b) is considered as non compliant

(7) Electronic Archive (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	Policies / budget / legal documents Refers to archive of policies, budget or legal documents for a minimum of the previous one year
	E-participation activities Refers to archive of past e-participation events or initiative for a minimum of the previous one year
	Archive responses by government to citizen's questions, queries and inputs Refers to archive of previous responses given to citizens who had sent in their questions, queries and input to the agencies via feedback form
Conditions	Policies / budget / legal documents a) Documents listed must be for a minimum of the previous one year b) Archive of other than policies / budget / legal documents documents is considered as non compliant for this criterion
	E-participation activities All condition must be complied: a) Events or initiatives listed must be for a minimum of the previous one year b) Details of event must be displayed i.e. date, participant, feedback, outcome c) Archive of list of the e-participation activities only is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(7) Electronic Archive (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>Archive responses by government to citizen's questions, queries and inputs</p> <p>All condition must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The compilation of questions / queries/ inputs and responses from the agency must be for a minimum of the previous one yearb) The compilation of questions / queries/ inputs and responses from the agency must originate from the feedback form made available in the agency websitec) Archive of information that is less than a year is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(8) W3C Disability Accessibility

(1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>Level A</p> <p>Level A refers to the compliance of Level A of Web Content Accessibility Guidelines (WCAG) 2.0 that allows a disabled person to be able to use the website</p> <hr/> <p>Accessibility for the visually impaired</p> <p>Accessibility to the visually impaired refers to the ability of the website to allow for a person who has sight loss that cannot be fully corrected using glasses or contact lenses¹ to access it</p>
Conditions	<p>Level A</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Websites are required to comply with the requirements of WCAG 2.0b) Usage of Online Tool: WAVE - http://wave.webaim.org/c) Utilisation of other tool besides WAVE is considered as non compliant for this criterion

¹ <http://www.nhs.uk/conditions/Visual-impairment/Pages/Introduction.aspx>

(8) W3C Disability Accessibility

(2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>Accessibility for the visually impaired</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The website must provide at least one of the following:<ul style="list-style-type: none">i. Ability to change the font sizeii. Ability to change the font typeiii. Ability to change the background colourb) Inconsistency of font size, type of background colour are considered as non compliant for this criterion

¹ <http://www.nhs.uk/conditions/Visual-impairment/Pages/Introduction.aspx>

(9) Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ)

Categories	Description
Definition	Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ) refers to the compilation of questions that are frequently asked by the website users
Conditions	a) The questions and answers must be related to the agency b) An empty FAQ section is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(10) Feedback Form

Categories	Description
Definition	Feedback Form refers to the the opinion expressed by users on the website functionality, usage experience or issues related to the agency
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Feedback Form is working/error-freeb) Enquiry must be sent through to the respective agencyc) Submission of Feedback Form that did not go through, and / or without notification of successful transaction is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(11) Feedback Auto-Notification

Categories	Description
Definition	Feedback Auto-Notification refers to the notification prompted / displayed after the submission of feedback by a user.
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The notification must provide information on the status of the feedback form submission on whether it has been sent or receivedb) The notification message must include the time frame for response from the relevant officerc) Notification without time frame is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(12) User Opinion Features

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>User Opinion Features refers to the features that share and display information of user opinion and feedback that highlight trending topics</p> <p>Some of the features that are commonly used by websites are tag clouds and “hot topics”¹</p>
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The website must have at least one of the commonly used user opinion features / highlight such as tag cloud and “hot topics”b) The features above must be displayed in relation to user opinion such as frequent search, user poll results and top keyword used for searchc) Empty tag clouds or “hot topics” are considered as non compliant for this criterion

¹ e.g. of Tag Cloud used for frequent searches <http://www.mma.gov.br>

(13) Updates via Email or RSS

Categories	Description
Definition	Updates via Email or RSS refers to the feature whereby updates and latest news of the agency can be subscribed by user via mailing list or RSS
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Users must be able to successfully subscribe to the email updates or RSSb) The email updates or RSS must be updated on monthly basisc) The “unsubscribe from list” option or link must be included in all emails sent to the usersd) There are active email subscription and / or RSS feede) The email update and/or RSS must be relevant and related topics to the agency (example: latest development on my agency's initiatives)f) Provision of RSS services without any feed or inactive email subscription are considered as non compliant for this criterion

(14) Audio / Video

Categories	Description
Definition	Audio / Video refers to a segment of video or media files containing audio or video that has both an in-time and an out-time within a larger video element
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Audio or video clip must be related to the agencyb) The clips can be streamed or downloadedc) Background music of the website and flash clips on landing page are not considered as part of this criterion

(15) Multi-Language for Content (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	Malay Language Malay Language refers to content availability in Malay Language
	English Language English Language refers to content availability in English Language
	Third Language Third Language refers to content availability in other languages. For example: Mandarin / Tamil
Conditions	Malay Language a) Content in Malay language is mandatory b) There is no multi-language content on the Malay Language version

(15) Multi-Language for Content (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>English Language</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The entire content within a website must be translated into English Languageb) Discrepancies between Malay and English languages must be avoidedc) There is no multi-language content on the English Language version <hr/> <p>Third Language - Provision of content in third language is optional</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The use of online tool is permissible with the condition to display a disclaimer notice informing users of its limitation and risksb) Provision of multi language content in the Third Language version due to error/ issues of usage of online tool is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(16) Multi-Language for Online Services

Categories	Description
Definition	Malay Language Malay Language refers to Online Services availability in Malay Language
	English Language English Language refers to Online Services availability in English Language
Conditions	Malay Language a) All of the Online Services provided in a website must be in Malay Language b) There is no multi-language content on the Malay Language version
	English Language All conditions must be complied: a) The entire content of the online services must be translated into English Language b) There is no multi-language content on the English Language version

(17) Publicising a CIO or equivalent

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>Publicising a CIO or equivalent refers to the display of information of the Chief Information Officer (CIO) of the agency on the website.</p> <p>This is in consideration of the significant role of CIO or its equivalent in designing, implementing and disseminating e-government throughout the entire public administration in a seamless way¹.</p>
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The CIO or an equivalent role must be reflected in the website. For example, in the organisation chart, staff directory or a specific pageb) No provision of item b) above on the website is considered as non compliant for this criterion

¹ UN E-Government Survey 2014 Report

(18) Contact Details (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>Telephone Number</p> <p>Telephone number refers to general telephone number(s) of the agency</p>
	<p>Address</p> <p>Address refers to general mailing address of the agency</p>
	<p>Email</p> <p>Email refers to general e-mail or webmaster email address of the agency</p>
Conditions	<p>Telephone Number</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Telephone number is clearly displayed in website b) Provision of direct line to officers is not considered for this criterion
	<p>Address</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Mailing address is clearly displayed in website b) Provision of outdated address is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(18) Contact Details (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p data-bbox="374 325 475 359">Email</p> <p data-bbox="374 396 973 431">All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul data-bbox="374 468 1858 868" style="list-style-type: none"><li data-bbox="374 468 1085 502">a) Email is clearly displayed in website<li data-bbox="374 539 1858 688">b) To avoid misuse of email addresses by other parties to send “spam emails”, the email addressed should be displayed differently ie hanani[dot]ahmad[at]moh[dot]com[dot]my (hanani.ahmad@moh.gov.my)<li data-bbox="374 725 1858 868">c) Provision of email address without necessary precaution as mentioned in item b) that may lead to spamming activities is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(19) Presence of Datasets (1/3)

Categories	Description
Definition	Machine-readable structured data Machine-readable structured data refers to provision of dataset in format such as XLS
	Non-proprietary form Non-proprietary form refers to provision of dataset in format such as CSV
	Application Programming Interfaces (APIs) Application Programming Interfaces (APIs) refers to provision of dataset in API
	Open standards from W3C Open standards from W3C refers to provision of dataset in the in format such as RDF and SPARQL

A dataset refers to a collection of data. Most commonly a dataset corresponds to the contents of a single database table, or a single statistical data matrix¹.

¹ <http://whatis.techtarget.com/definition/data-set>

(19) Presence of Datasets (2/3)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>Machine-readable structured data</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Dataset must be available in Malaysia Open Government Portal (http://www.data.gov.my)b) Link to the dataset in the above portal must be made available in the agency's websitec) Provision of dataset that belongs to other agency is not considered for this criterion <hr/> <p>Non-proprietary form</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Dataset must be available in Malaysia Open Government Portal (http://www.data.gov.my)b) Link to the dataset in the above portal must be made available in the agency's websitec) Provision of dataset that belongs to other agency is not considered for this criterion

(19) Presence of Datasets (3/3)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>Application Programming Interfaces (APIs)</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Dataset must be available in Malaysia Open Government Portal (http://www.data.gov.my) b) Link to the dataset in the above portal must be made available in the agency's website c) Provision of dataset that belongs to other agency is not considered for this criterion <hr/> <p>Open standards from W3C</p> <p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Dataset must be available in Malaysia Open Government Portal (http://www.data.gov.my) b) Link to the dataset in the above portal must be made available in the agency's website c) Provision of dataset that belongs to other agency is not considered for this criterion

(20) Dataset Guidelines

Categories	Description
Definition	Dataset Guidelines refer to guidelines describing on how to make use of datasets
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Guidelines must be provided in the agency website together within the page that provides the hyperlink to the datasetsb) Irrelevant guidelines that are not related to usage of dataset is considered as non compliant for this criterion

¹ <http://whatis.techtarget.com/definition/data-set>

(21) About Us

Categories	Description
Definition	About Us refers to a section of the website that provides information on the respective agency
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) It may be provided in a dedicated section or incorporated in the introduction pageb) Irrelevant information that are not related to the agency is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(22) Publications

Categories	Description
Definition	Publications refers to any publications issued by agencies that are published or downloadable in the websites
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Publications can be in e-book reader or downloadable format (e.g. .pdf, .epub)b) Publication must be related to agencyc) Journal and publication abstracts are not considered for this criterion

(23) Personalisation

Categories	Description
Definition	Personalisation refers to the delivery of appropriate content and services, tailor-made to the user's need with the aim is to improve the user's experience of a service ¹
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Sections are provided for specific users of the website Example: Students, Parents, Teachersb) Must be more than one category of usersc) The provision of personalisation for only one category is considered as non compliant for this criterion

¹[Personalization of Web Services: Opportunities and Challenges](#)

(24) Sitemap

Categories	Description
Definition	Sitemap refers to visual or textually organized model of a website's content that allows the users to navigate through the site to find the information they are looking for ¹
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: a) Sitemap must be dynamic i.e. hyperlinks are provided for the pages listed b) A static sitemap is considered as non compliant for this criterion

¹<http://searchsoa.techtarget.com/definition/site-map>

(25) Link to Other Websites

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>Link to myGov Portal</p> <p>Link to myGov Portal refers to the hyperlink provided on the website to access national portal i.e. myGov</p>
	<p>Link to Ministries/States</p> <p>Link to Ministries/States refers to the hyperlink provided on the website to access ministries portal</p>
Conditions	<p>Link to myGov Portal</p> <p>a) Hyperlink to myGov portal must be correct (http://www.malaysia.gov.my)</p> <p>b) The hyperlink is active. Inactive or broken link is considered as non compliant for this criterion</p>
	<p>Link to Ministries/States</p> <p>a) Hyperlink to respective parent e.g. Social Welfare department will provide a hyperlink to Ministry of Women, Family and Community Development</p> <p>b) Irrelevant, inactive or broken link for the hyperlink is considered as non compliant for this criterion</p>

(26) Find Information within 3 Clicks

Categories	Description
Definition	Find Information Within 3 Clicks refers to the navigation required to look for information within the websites
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) All the criteria listed on Pillar 2 (Content) must be obtainable within 3 clicks from the main pageb) All of the links provided are active (no broken link). Inactive or a broken link are considered as non-compliant

(27) Search Function

Categories	Description
Definition	Search Function refers to search function made available on the website for users to locate information within the websites only
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Search function is working whereby it prompted a listed of resultb) Result must consist of information within the agency website onlyc) Search engine result that includes information from other agency's website is not considered for this criterion

(28) Advanced Search

Categories	Description
Definition	Advanced Search refers to additional features that a search engine could have
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) At least one of the advanced search options is made available<ul style="list-style-type: none">i. Auto Complete/Predictive feature for relevant keyword when entering searchii. Filter capabilities for specific section of the websiteb) Result must consist of information within the agency website onlyc) Search function without the any of the advanced search options in item a) above is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(29) Searchable Database

Categories	Description
Definition	Searchable Database refers to searches that access information in specific section or page within the websites. Example of specific section: staff directory, circular, image gallery, news article
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Searchable database is working whereby it prompts a listed of resultb) Result must consist of information within the specific section or page onlyc) Search result that display section or page from other agency's website is not considered for this criterion

(30) Find Website Using Search Tool

Categories	Description
Definition	Find Website Using Search Tool refers to searching of agency's website using any search tool/search engine such as Google, Yahoo!, bing, Ask, AOL
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) "Google" search engine is used to search for the agency websiteb) Search must be conducted in Malay and English Languagesc) Agency website is listed in the first page of the "Google" search engine resultd) Search result from search engines other than "Google" is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(31) Client's Charter

Categories	Description
Definition	Client's Charter refers to a written commitment by the organisation to deliver the service to its clients through an open, clear and transparent approach. It is also a guarantee for standard quality delivery. On client's perspective, it is a guaranteed promise for standard quality delivery. ¹
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The agency's main Client's Charter is displayed on the websiteb) The Client's Charter must be specific and measurablec) Display of any Client's charter that belongs to a unit or section in an agency instead of the agency is considered as non compliant for this criterion

¹ [Pekeliling Kemajuan Pentadbiran Awam Bilangan 1 Tahun 2008](#)

(32) Achievement of Client's Charter

Categories	Description
Definition	Achievement of Client's Charter refers to the measurement of client's charter compliance
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Achievement must be updated on monthly basisb) The achievement of the previous two months must be included e.g. When a user is accessing the website in the month of October, the user must be able to view achievement of Client Charter for the months of August.c) Remarks is required to those agencies that do not measure the achievement on monthly basisd) Display of outdated achievement is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(33) Statistic of Online Services

Categories	Description
Definition	Statistic of Online Services refers to the measurement of the Online Services usage
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Usage of all online services must be trackedb) Tracking must be updated on monthly basisc) Tracking of the past two months must be included<ul style="list-style-type: none">• e.g. When a user is accessing the website in the month of October, the user must be able to view Statistic of Online Services for the months of Augustd) Statistic of selected instead of all Online Services provided on the website is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(34) Freedom of Information Legislation

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>Refers to the display of information with regards to the Freedom of Information legislations with the website</p> <p>The Freedom of Information Act gives citizens the right to access recorded information held by public sector¹</p>
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <p>a) For agencies bound by the Freedom of Information: Information and its processes must be clearly displayed within the website</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• For agencies that is not bound by Freedom of Information Act: Request for Information form may be provided for users to request for information not made available on the website, subjected to the Terms and Conditions set by the agency <p>b) All information provided must be relevant and related to the Freedom of Information</p>

¹ <https://www.gov.uk/make-a-freedom-of-information-request/the-freedom-of-information-act>

(35) Privacy Policy Statement or Data Protection Acts

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>Privacy Policy Statement¹ refers to the website's privacy policy that provides information on some or all of the ways the website gathers, uses, discloses, and manages a visitor's data.</p> <p>Personal Data Protection Act² (PDPA) refers to the Personal Data Protection Act 2010 [Act 709] that regulates the collection, recording, holding or storing of personal data, and carrying out of any operation on personal data for commercial transactions. It does not apply to Federal and State Governments.</p>
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) The website must provide either a Privacy Policy Statement or Personal Data Protection Act based on the services provided within the websiteb) The privacy policy statement or the Personal Data Protection Act must be clearly displayed on the footer of the main page of the website and hyperlinked to the full information within the website

¹ <http://webguide.gov.au/about/privacy/>
<http://www.google.com/policies/privacy/>
https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Privacy_policy

² <http://www.kkmm.gov.my/pdf/Personal%20Data%20Protection%20Act%202010.pdf>

(36) Online Procurement Announcement

Categories	Description
Definition	Online Procurement Announcement refers to e-procurement announcements for bidding processes
Conditions	All conditions must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Announcement must be displayed in the agency's website or linked to e-procurement platformb) If there is no announcement to be made, "No latest announcement" must be displayedc) Empty announcement section is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(37) Online E-Participation Policy or Guideline

Categories	Description
Definition	<p>Refers to the display of an online e-participation¹ policy or guidelines on the website to inform and guide users on the terms and conditions for participation.</p> <p>E-Participation refers to the process of engaging citizens – both online and offline - in policy and decision-making in order to make it participatory, inclusive, and deliberative²</p>
Conditions	<p>All conditions must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) E-participation policy or guidelines must be provided on the e-participation section of the website<ul style="list-style-type: none">• For central e-participation policy, the link to the full policy must be clearly displayed• Agency-level guidelines must be made available on the e-participation sectionb) The policy or guidelines must include the terms and conditions for participationc) Provision of policy or guidelines that are not related to e-participation is considered as non compliant for this criterion

¹ Examples of online e-participation policies

<http://www.economy.ae/English/Pages/eParticipationPolicy.aspx>

<http://www.ictqatar.qa/en/documents/document/e-participation-policy>

² <http://www.unpan.org/dpadm/>

(38) Promotion of E-Participation Initiative (1/3)

Categories	Description
Definition	Online calendar of participatory events Online calendar of participatory events refers to an interactive calendar that allow user to view e-participation events or initiatives
	Email alerts for e-participation initiative Email alerts for e-participation initiative refers to an email subscription that allow users to received updates and latest news on e-participation events or initiatives
	Really Simple Syndication (RSS) for e-participation initiative Really Simple Syndication (RSS) for e-participation initiative refers to the feature whereby updates and latest news of e-participation events or initiatives can be subscribed by user RSS

(38) Promotion of E-Participation Initiative (2/3)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>Online calendar of participatory events</p> <p>All condition must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Calendar must consist of previous, current and future e-participation events or initiatives conducted by agencyb) On the calendar, by clicking on the event that is ongoing or has yet to take place, the calendar will display the details of the events or initiativesc) On the calendar, by clicking on the past event, the calendar will display the electronic archive consisting of past event details i.e. date, participant, feedback, outcomed) Provision of calendar without information on the e-participation events or initiatives is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(38) Promotion of E-Participation Initiative (3/3)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>Email alerts for e-participation initiative</p> <p>All condition must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Users must be able to successfully subscribed to the email alertb) The “unsubscribe from list” option or link must be included in all emails sent to the usersc) Irrelevant email alerts is considered as non compliant for this criterion <p>Really Simple Syndication (RSS) for e-participation initiative</p> <p>All condition must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Users must be able to successfully subscribed to the RSSb) The RSS must be updated on monthly basisc) Irrelevant RSS is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(39) Presence of E-Consultation Mechanisms (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	Availability of social networking features Availability of social networking features refers to presence of government agencies' official accounts on the social network sites e.g. Facebook to engage with citizens in deeper contributions to and deliberation on public policies and services
	Availability of tools in order to obtain raw (non-deliberative) public opinion for public policy deliberation (e.g. online forums, media tools, polls, voting tolls and petition tools) Availability of tools in order to obtain raw public opinion for public policy deliberation refers to the presence of the official social media account of the agency to engage citizens into deeper contributions and deliberation on public policies and services matters

E-consultation¹ is a mechanism or tool that allow the Government to invite discussion on specific information / issues / policy to garner inputs from the citizens

<http://www.computer.org/csdl/proceedings/hicss/2004/2056/05/205650117a.pdf>

(39) Presence of E-Consultation Mechanisms (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>Availability of social networking features</p> <p>All condition must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Link to the social network must be available in the agency websiteb) The features must be updatedc) Social networking is used to engage with citizens in public policies and servicesd) Social network that solely provides events updates of the agency is considered as non compliant for this criterion <p>Availability of tools in order to obtain raw (non-deliberative) public opinion for public policy deliberation (e.g. online forums, media tools, polls, voting tolls and petition tools)</p> <p>All condition must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) All the tools provided by the website must be active and error-freeb) All the tool are available within the websites or link to the tool is made available in the websitec) All the tools are used for the purpose of solliciting input from citizen on policy deliberationd) Provision of tools that are used for other purposes than e-consultation is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(40) Presence Of E-Decision Making Tools (1/2)

Categories	Description
Definition	Citizen Feedback on Services/National Strategy/Policy Citizen Feedback on Services / National Strategy / Policy refers to provision of an avenue where citizens can provide their feedback on agency's services, national strategy or policy
	Publish Citizen Feedback on Services/National Strategy/Policy Publish Citizen Feedback on Services / National Strategy / Policy refers to the display of citizens feedback obtained from the above avenue
	Publish Outcome of Citizen Feedback on Services/National Strategy/Policy Publish Outcome of Citizen Feedback on Services / National Strategy / Policy refers to display of the outcome from the citizens feedback

(40) Presence Of E-Decision Making Tools (2/2)

Categories	Description
Conditions	<p>Citizen Feedback on Services/National Strategy/Policy</p> <p>All condition must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) All the avenues provided are active and error-freeb) The feedback requested from citizen is related to either services, national strategy or policyc) Provision of online form inactive and not related to the provision of feedback for Services/National Strategy/Policy is considered as non compliant for this criterion
	<p>Publish Citizen Feedback on Services/National Strategy/Policy</p> <p>All condition must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) All of the citizen feedback must be shared in the websiteb) Display of irrelevant feedback to Services/National Strategy/Policy is considered as non compliant for this criterion
	<p>Publish Outcome of Citizen Feedback on Services/National Strategy/Policy</p> <p>All condition must be complied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) All of the outcome from the citizen feedback must be shared in the agency's websiteb) Publishing of outcome of feedback that irrelevant to Services/National Strategy/Policy is considered as non compliant for this criterion

(41) Look and Feel

Categories	Description
Definition	Refers to how the site looks to the user and how it feels when he or she is interacting with it ¹
Conditions	All condition must be complied: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Maintain the same look and feel on every pageb) Consistent header, footer and side panels on every pagec) If the case where an English Language content section is available, the look and feel must be consistent as the Malay Language sectiond) The colour of the website is not considered for this criterion

¹ [What is the "Look and Feel" of a Website? And Why It's Important](#)



THANK YOU